**Non-Academic Bi-Annual Review Form**

**Years Two and Four of the Program Review Cycle**

The Coconino Community College bi-annual review will consist of two areas: an update to the Program Review Action Plans/Recommendations and a review of any student service evaluations taken.

Prior to completing the Bi-Annual Review form, the Assessment Coordinator will provide the program with the Program Review Actions Plans/Recommendations from the last completed program review. In Year Four, the previous Bi-Annual Review information will be provided as well.

Provide a status update to any of the recommendations. Then analyze any student service evaluations taken during the previous two years. Attach any department/program minutes or other appropriate documentation that recorded discussion of updates to recommendations or of student service evaluation.

**I. ACTION PLAN/RECOMMENDATION UPDATE**

**1. Action Item # (# as indicated on last completed program review):**

**(1)** Increase participant engagement

**(2)** Increase retention and graduation rates

**(3)** Develop an early alert process

**(4)** Increase recruitment activities

**(5)** Streamline tutoring services under one person at the college

**(6)** Increase opportunities for First Gen programming at CCC

**(7)** Set up emergency funding for students in need

**2. Anticipated date for completion:**

The TRIO SSS grant runs on a 5-year grant cycle, these goals would be accomplished within that 5-year grant cycle, which is currently running between 2020-2025.

**3. List potential benefits to student success:**

**(1)** Creating new or more opportunities for student engagement – research has shown that students who are actively engaged in their campus/TRIO SSS programs are more likely to succeed. They are most likely to develop relationships on campus with staff and faculty and receive both academic and non-academic support. This high level of support ultimately helps students retain and persist through the college environment. In addition, students are more likely to look back on their college experience and feel fulfilled and/or have a positive effect of their time spent on campus and the relationships they build will go forward with them into other areas of their lives.

**(2)** As determined by the TRIO SSS grant – and required by the Dept of Education, each year, SSS programs around the country are required to submit an “annual performance report” to the government with outlined set objectives for retention, graduation, and transfer rates. If these objectives are not met, the program could be at risk of not being refunded. It’s imperative that the program makes every effort to keep a steady pace of progression on these numbers every year to ensure future program funding. In addition to these requirements, research has shown that first generation, low income, and students with disabilities do struggle with retention and graduation rates compared to their peers who do not identify with those attributes. This is why TRIO SSS programs were developed in the first place to help equalize the playing field for these students. By keeping our retention/graduation rates high we do two things: (1) We ensure success of our students during their time at CCC and also ensure they have the ability to transfer to the University of their choice, (2) It helps the College’s mission and strategic goals for increasing overall retention and graduation rates. Lastly, it helps students build confidence in the higher education process, helping them build autonomy with knowledge and an understanding of how to navigate the higher education landscape. “Growth mindset” allows them to see themselves as university material and capable of achieving a bachelor’s degree.

**(3)** Develop an early alert process for students in the TRIO SSS program. Many institutions around the country use various ways to keep a pulse on student academic performance with meaningful outreach at critical times throughout the semester as a means to provide specific interventions to improve academic success. We believe this is an important piece that has been missing at CCC since 2018 when Starfish Early Alert software was discontinued. TRIO SSS staff believe being able to communicate directly with our participants' faculty and offer strategic support at critical times in the semester will help our students academically and we are holding them accountable when it comes to their academic success.

**(4)** By increasing our visibility on campus through various marketing tactics such as; in class presentations and tabling around campus, marketing our program to eligible students- we enable students to help themselves. Often students do not know or understand all the services on campus and/or what those services can do for them. By increasing our recruitment efforts, we can outreach to more students who may be eligible and get them into our program sooner than later thus helping by providing them with all academic and non-academic support and wrap-around services that TRIO SSS is known for.

**(5)** Streamline admin processes with our tutoring program. The rationale for this is to help both TRIO SSS staff and CCC administrators intentionally create more time with their students and spend less time on the paperwork side of things. For example, the way tutoring services are currently set up creates much duplicity in administrative paperwork both for the tutoring coordinator and TRIO SSS staff. This additional time takes away from TRIO SSS staff being able to work with students, engage in those one on relationships, and work on additional programming that benefits our participants' success.

**(6)** Set up intentional First-Generation programming at CCC. Many other schools have first gen specific programming – for example, NAU has a First Gen Scholars program and within that program set forth an initiative of specific program through the year in the way of conferences or webinars around topics of first gen success. This intensive programming also includes mentoring, pathways with certain milestones, summer bridge programs, and even social programming supports students financially with scholarship incentives, TRI-Alpha Honor Society and more. While all these initiatives may not be a good fit at CCC or would have to be built up – all of these ideas would help our first-generation students create meaningful relationships with both staff, faculty and their peer groups throughout campus, cultivating community and belonging. This positive reinforcement of community and belonging is beneficial and is a key strategy in retaining students in the community college environment.

**(7)** Establish an emergency fund for TRIO SSS students and first-gen students on CCC’s campus. We know one of the biggest challenges our students are facing is financial constraints and it’s one of the biggest reasons many students stop out of college. By having an established emergency fund on campus that students can apply for emergency use funding at any point during the academic year may be one creative way to help mitigate the stop out rate so often seen in our community college first generation students. Having an emergency fund may help students pull together enough funds to help them get through the semester or continue on to the next semester without stopping altogether.

**4. Status Update** (Only Update during Bi-annual Review Reporting)

**5. Last reviewed date:** 3/03/2020 (5-year action plan created)

**II. EVALUATION OF STUDENT SERVICES**

**1. Description of Service Provided:**

Goal (#3) Develop an early alert process for TRIO SSS students.

**2. Method of Evaluation:**

In Spring 2021, TRIO SSS conducted a first ever proactive email campaign targeted at faculty who have SSS students in their classrooms. This campaign was twofold; to get a better understanding of where students were performing academically based on instructor feedback and to conduct specific outreach to underperforming students in effort to help them pass their classes. This effort is not only part of the new 2020-2025 TRIO SSS Grant, but also compliments the institution's approach to drive retention and graduation rates. March 3rd, was determined to be the day when emails go out to instructors as this was the 8-week mark or middle of the term. In researching intervention best practices, this was determined to be a crucial touch point for providing strategic and targeted academic interventions such as academic advising and tutoring assistance for students who may be underperforming.

TRIO SSS is currently serving 146 students at CCC. On March 3rd, 42 instructors at the college were individually emailed informing them they had SSS students in their classrooms. We requested any solicited feedback and left it at the discretion of the instructor on what they wanted to share. Of the 42 instructors, we heard back from 13 (30%). We reached out to any student that an instructor had concerns about which included: life/personal concerns, time management concerns, classroom participation, etc., in addition, we also reached out to any students who were under performing with a grade of D or F.

The week of March 8th, (12) SSS students were called and/or emailed about various interventions such as academic advising and paired with life skills advice offered through a caring and compassionate approach. SSS one-on-one tutoring was offered for those students who were not utilizing tutoring service through our program. A list of those 12 students was collected along with any interventions offered which will be filed for further review at the end of spring semester and compared to end of semester grades.

**3. Semester Information Gathered:** Spring 2021

**4. Results of Evaluation:**

In June 2021, an Argos report of grade point averages for the 12 students that were flagged in the spring semester from initial outreach was compared to the TRIO SSS data set which records targeted interventions such as advising and tutoring recommendations for each TRIO SSS student.

Of those 12 students, 6 or (50%) ended up passing their spring term in “good standing” with a GPA of 2.0 or higher and; 3 or (25%) of those students used tutoring services with TRIO SSS in spring 2021.

**5. Associated Benchmarks:** New pilot initiative, however, after conducting research with other TRIO SSS professionals through webinars and listservs discussions, we determined that many SSS programs around the country had some sort of internal mid-term review plan or external software that did early alert for the entire student body. We felt so strongly about the idea of having some way to monitor a student's progress within the classroom environment, we wrote this into our new 2020-2025 grant proposal.

**III. ANALYSIS:**

While the results of this informal pilot for early alert has a mixture of complicated outcomes, the results may be impaired by several factors.

1. The pandemic of 2020 had a significant and lasting impression into the spring 2021 semester, resulting in already at-risk students struggling to maintain through their online/zoom coursework encountering zoom fatigue, apathy towards college courses, low engagement in student life, faculty office hours, tutoring, etc. While 50% of our students in this pilot did successfully pass their courses- it's considerably less than our normal rate of 87% and objective that is measured by the Department of Education on an annual basis through our annual performance report.
2. The pilot of this outreach initiative was maximum effort for staff and having a dedicated software with automation of such outreach would be of great benefit not just for TRIO SSS students but the entirety of the Institution. Having to individually email 42 instructors was time consuming and tedious in nature. Emails are easily deleted or missed and having a rule set up in an automated workflow would increase chances that instructors would see and respond appropriately to such emails about their student’s performance.

**IV. UPDATE ON ANY PREVIOUS ACTIONS: N/A**

**V. FUTURE ACTIONS:**

Having a targeted outreach campaign to students at the 8-week mark did make a difference for 3 or (25%) of the flagged TRIO SSS students. Many more students may have been flagged if each instructor took part in the initial outreach, but we did not hear back from the majority of instructors emailed. Having instructor buy-in on the early alert process is so crucial, as we are only as good as the information we receive from our faculty. In addition, the overall feel of the 2020 pandemic made for a difficult learning environment for students, many of whom were facing significant outside stress, personally and financially and no amount of intervention within school may have made a significant difference in their choice to withdraw or in some cases fail courses. It has been a hard three semesters for most students in higher education due to the challenges faced with remote learning and pandemic stressors. We can only hope as higher education starts to offer more modalities both for classes and tutoring, that students who are at risk will find more encouragement and creative ways to persist through the academic environment. The institution should clearly look to invest in software that can identify students at risk of failing in a timely manner with targeted interventions and academic advisors assigned to follow up on each flagged student to ensure they are getting the help they need. Having software that is automated with rules and workflows would be a beneficial update to the college.