**2017-2018 Non-Academic Program Review – Starfish Early Alert**

**Program Review Documents should be completed and submitted to the appropriate dean/reporting supervisor and the assessment coordinator no later than June 30th, 2019.**

# Executive Summary

A short summary of the program review that readers can rapidly become acquainted with the material without having to read all of it. This section is written last.

Coconino Community College’s Early Alert program is a service provided by the Student Affairs department. Using a software, Starfish, all registered students are exported from the college’s information system, Banner into Starfish every semester. Information imported into Starfish includes the students name, student ID number, major, phone number, student email, and semester schedule. These students are then assigned to advisors in Starfish based on their program of study. Having the students in Starfish allows early alert flags to be raised by their instructors at any time, however, the program was set up to provide two scheduled opportunities for instructors to raise a flag on a student.

Surveys are the scheduled opportunities to raise a flag on a student. They are sent out twice a semester to instructors to identify students that may need support services. Instructors receive an email when surveys are open, a reminder at the end of the first week if they have not completed their class survey and a third reminder the week the survey closes. Surveys can be completed by instructors in a roster format for each class they teach. This is to allow easy viewing and flag selection. Flags options for the first survey are set as:

• Attendance Concern

• Low Quiz/Test Scores

• Missing/Late Assignments

• General Academic Concern

• Tutoring Referral

• Keep up the Good Work

The second survey, scheduled for weeks 9 through 10 have the following options:

• Low Quiz/Test Score

• Missing/Late Assignments

• Attendance Concern

• General Academic Concern

• In Danger of Failing

• Tutoring Referral

• Outstanding Academic Performance

Once a flag has been raised on a student, outreach efforts by advisors are to be completed within 48 hours. All outreach efforts are documented in Starfish and when a flag is closed, instructors receive notification of the closed flag.

It is important to note that the Early Alert program includes all students enrolled in an online or in-person course at the Lone Tree Campus, Fourth Street innovation Center, and the Page Instructional Site. The software the college uses for their Early Alert is Starfish.

The program is in its fourth year and while there has been some minor improvements to the process, the program continues to be underutilized. Additionally, Starfish has many great features that for a college our size is not necessary and the features that could enhance our Early Alert program we simply do not have staffing and fiscal resources to take advantage of them. The college continues to put students first and upon review of Starfish it has determined that direct services to students is a priority and will not continue the use of Starfish.

Program Overview (Narrative)

A brief description of the program explaining why it exists, what its function is within the college, and the services the program provides. Finally, describe how the program contributes to student success.

Fall 2015 Coconino Community College implemented the Starfish Early Alert system, in an effort to identify students that were in need of early intervention services to help them succeed in their courses. Early intervention or support services include Advising, Career Services, Disability Resources, TRIO, and Learning Support. When working with students that have been flagged, advisors not only discuss the resources on our campus but also refer students to outside agencies for mental health, nutrition, substance abuse, housing, and counseling services.

Starfish is a software that allows one person, in this case, the Director of Student Success & Access, the ability to create a progress survey for every course in a semester. The progress survey is sent electronically to faculty, includes their course roster and the following *Flags/Referrals* to select from:

• Attendance Concern

• Low Quiz/Test Scores

• Missing/Late Assignments

• General Academic Concern

• Tutoring Referral

• Keep up the Good Work

Instructors have two weeks to complete the survey.

The Director of Success & Access assigns a flag/referral once an instructor has completed their survey. The flag is then assigned to an advisor based on the students major or CCC2NAU status. TRIO students are automatically assigned to the TRIO department for follow-up. Advisors make three attempts to contact students with flags via phone or email. If successful contact is made, the advisor is able to discuss in-person and online tutoring services (Learning Support), educational plans, answer financial aid questions, and refer students to community resources if necessary.

# Program Mission, Goals, and Objectives

## Provide Program Mission, if applicable

Provide a clear and concise statement of the program’s mission and how that mission ties into the overall mission of the college.

Early alert is a service provided by the Office of Student Affairs. Purpose of Student Affairs: Student Services to facilitate access to the college and to support learners’ attainment of educational goals.

## Goals and Objectives

Provide a list of the goals, objectives, and outcomes of the program. When applicable, define how these goals align with the current strategic plan and provide evidence on how the program has been working to accomplish these goals.

Goal: Identify students in need of support services through the utilization of an early alert program

**Expected Student Learning Outcomes**

As a result of Early Alert, students will:

1. Modify identified negative behavior
2. Persist in their academic course(s)
3. Utilize support services
4. Respond to advisor communication

Early alert addresses goal two of the strategic plan that states, “CCC will promote a learner-centered environment that incorporates innovative strategies and support structures intended to reduce student attrition and increase retention.” Tactics under this strategy include:

1. Raise awareness of Early Alert program
2. Identify levels of flags/interventions that require follow-up
3. Identify early alert response workflow

# Changes/Improvements Since Last Review (if applicable)

## Recommendations from most recent program review and/or advisory

## committee(s)

List recommendations that were received given during the last program review, and any that have occurred within the previous five years. Elaborate on actions taken on the recommendations and the effects these actions had on the program. If no action was taken on a recommendation, describe why no action was taken.

N/A

# Personnel, Facilities, Resources and Funds

## Personnel

Provide an overall description of the staffing and organization of the program. Provide a description of the distribution of responsibilities between the positions within the program. Detail the professional development opportunities offered and utilized by staff.

The Director of Student Success & Access is responsible for creating surveys, assigning flags, training, and informing staff & faculty of flag follow-up process.

Through the use of an integrated service model, the Student Affairs department has been able to create a workflow process for early alert follow-up to include all professional and para-professional staff in the department; Advising, CCC2NAU, TRIO, Learning Support, Student Life, Recruitment, and Testing. totaling 10 full-time staff and three part-time staff. Early alert flags are routed to the specialized areas first (CCC2NAU & TRIO) then are assigned based on the students major. All Student Affairs professional staff members are assigned a cohort/major. Appendix A provides academic advisors job description that includes early alert and intrusive advising responsibilities.

Facilities and Resources

Describe any designated space that is provided to support the program. Describe any designated equipment purchased to support the program. Provide observations on how the facilities and equipment contribute to the mission of the program. Provide observations/data on how the facilities and equipment contribute the quality/quantity of services provided by the program. Elaborate on future trends or needs of the program detailing how this will lead to student success.

All professional staff assigned to early alert cohorts are located at the Lone Tree Campus Student Center, a centralized area for students to access student support services, which is a combination of office space and cubicles. The college’s Early Alert program is managed through the Starfish software, which requires access to a computer and phone system. Staff working with early alert flags utilize Banner and DegreeWorks as a technology tool to serve students.

## Finances

## Revenues and expenditures aligned within the budget, and what revenues are generated through program activities. Any applicable trends and impacts on the budget should also be discussed.

This is not a revenue-generating program other than, the tuition paid from students that return for future semesters. The expenditures include personnel, software licensing, and technology needs such as computers, phone, and internet. The average cost of the Starfish software was $42,804 annually (appendix B).

# Partnerships and Collaborations, if exist

## Internal

List any internal committee(s), advisory groups, or other collaborations the program participates in. Detail the composition, information on meetings, other functions or activates of involvement.

* The Director of Student Success & Access represents Student Affairs on the Retention Committee that meets once a month.
* The Dean of Student Affairs chairs the CARE (formerly REACH) committee and the Dean of Student Success & Access is a member of this committee that meets monthly and on an as needed basis.
* The Dean of Student Affairs and the Director of Student Success & Access are members of the college’s Behavior Intervention Team that meets on an as needed basis.
* The Dean of Student Affairs is a voting member of the College Council that meets once a month.
* There is regular collaboration with faculty that includes on-boarding presentations of Early Alert, semester email reminders, and meetings with the Dean of Academic Affairs, the Dean of CTE, and the Provost as needed.
* Professional staff in the various Student Affairs areas; Advising, Career, CCC2NAU, Disability Resources, Learning Support, Recruitment, Student Life, and Testing Services assist with student referrals or flags for follow-up with students.
* Collaboration with the IT network administrator is essential to setting parameters in Starfish for cohorts, integrating new students into Starfish, and setting up semester roles and cohorts.

## External

Identify advisory councils, high school connections, community agency connections, or other forms of connections which pertain to the mission and objectives of the program. Detail the composition, information on meetings, other functions or activates of involvement.

Partnerships throughout the community have been identified to refer students that are experiencing emotional/mental support, physical abuse, homelessness, food insecurities, and employment.

* The Director of Student Success & Access & the Recruitment Coordinator participate in the Northern Arizona Interfaith Council
* Director of Student Success participates in community discussion panels with the City of Flagstaff, Flagstaff Police Department, NAU, and Northern Arizona behavioral agencies to discuss intervention services and training.

# Customer and Services Review

## Review of Provided Services

Provide a detailed review of the services provided by the program. Explain how the services support teaching and learning within the college.

The early alert program provides an opportunity to connect students with a professional staff member, which is also an advisor, to discuss educational goals and identify support services the student may need to use to reach those goals. Referral to support services is essential in helping students navigate the path to achieve such goals. The Early Alert program allows faculty in all college courses to identify students that may be in need of early intervention through the use of the progress survey.

Early Alert provides the following:

* Online access to identify students in need of support services automatically generated and sent to faculty within the first month of the semester but faculty throughout the semester can also initiate the flags/referrals.
* Flag/referrals require a communication follow-up via phone call or email to talk with students regarding support services. This intervention educates the student on support services at the college and within the community while teaching students how to locate such services.

## Support of Students

1. Define the metrics used to measure student success.

CCC’s Early Alert program was created to assist students that were identified by instructors, with support services. Initial goal was to inform the college staff & faculty of the program, train faculty and staff, and market the use of the tool.

* Number of progress surveys completed by faculty (Chart 1)
* Increase in the amount of Learning Support usage (Chart 2)
* Number of students contacted for level 2, 3, and 4 (Chart 3)

1. Analysis of the demographics of the participants of the program, identify any populations not being served, trends and patterns and comparisons to other Arizona programs should be discussed. Use results of qualitative measures aimed at how best the program provides services or support students.

Chart 1 below is a breakdown of the number of progress surveys that were sent out to be completed by instructor, how many of them were viewed, and how many were actually completed by the instructor. Note that a progress survey was sent out for every course in the semester. The chart includes duplicate numbers.

Source: Starfish Report

* The chart shows that there was never a point where 50% of the faculty completed the survey. However, once an instructor viewed a survey there was a 90% likely hood that they would complete the progress survey. The chart includes duplicate numbers.

Source: Starfish Report

* The number of students referred to tutoring services because of the system-generated survey, did not show significant increases. The chart includes duplicate numbers.

Source: Starfish Report

* The chart above shows the number of surveys that were completed by faculty and how many were cleared by an advisor. Clearing a flag involves at least three attempts to contact a student via phone or email.

C. Support of Faculty and Staff

Analysis of the demographics of the participants of the program, identify any populations not being served, trends and patterns and comparisons to other Arizona programs should be discussed. Use results of qualitative measures aimed at how best the program provides services or support faculty and staff.

All registered students enrolled for courses in any given semester are part of the Early Alert program. Starfish, the software for the Early Alert program, was set up to capture only the students name, major, courses registered for, and student Comet identification number.

As indicated in Chart 1 the program supports student success of all students by sending a progress survey to all instructors that are teaching a course for the semester. The data also indicates the number of progress surveys completed by instructors. Online students are included in progress surveys, however, support services for these students can be limited even with the online and zoom tutoring options.

Faculty and community partnerships are essential partners for an early alert program to succeed. Through collaborative efforts with academics and support services students can receive the assistance they need to help them succeed in their courses.

The college is in the process of developing degree pathways that will require input from faculty and student affairs to be successful. This collaborative project will change the current advising model to include intrusive advising techniques that ensures students are on the right academic track, multi-semester academic planning, and twice a semester check-in with students.

# Analysis

## SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats) Analysis describe using the following definitions:

Strengths – These are things that are currently done well at the present time. They need marginal or no improvement. This is where you recognize and describe accomplishments and changes that have already taken place which have led to the improvement of some aspect of the program.

The process of sending out progress surveys has gone through several revisions to identify the current best practice; automatically send out one survey within the first 3-4 weeks of the semester to all instructors teaching a class. Students are pulled from Banner every night to keep Starfish current with all registered students. Cohorts from banner such as TRIO, CCC2NAU, and Veteran students are also identified in Starfish to easily assign flags to the appropriate professional staff/department. Currently TRIO is the only cohort that receives their flags directly; all other cohorts must be assigned.

* + - * What are the advantages of the program?
* Early intervention helps to connect students with faculty and staff.
* Early alert can help students find resources that can help them succeed.
* Faculty and staff collaborate to best serve students.
  + - * What does the program do well?
* The program provides an opportunity for faculty, staff, and students to communicate in one place.
* The programs use of a software to manage student a high number of flags/referrals with limited staffing resources.
  + - * What relevant resources do you have access to?
* The use of Banner, DegreeWorks, Tutoring schedule, and Outlook calendars is essential when assisting students.
  + - * What do other people see as the program’s strengths?
* Ease of creating flags in the software, especially with instructors; their class roster is auto-populated to quickly identify students that need intervention (flags/referrals).
  + - * What would the program boast about to someone who knows nothing about this organization and its work?
* Much larger institutions do not use early intervention software to identify and support student success.

Weaknesses – These are things that are not going well at the present time. These are aspects of the program which need to be corrected.

* What can be improved?
* The software used could be more user-friendly.
* The number of advisors could be increased to allow for an increased number of outreach efforts to students identified as at-risk of failing.
* Increased collaboration within Student Affairs and Academics to create a realistic follow-up with students identified in an early alert program.
* Data collection improvements; 1. Capture additional demographic information of students (age, ethnicity, first-generation) 2. Faculty surveys for improvement of an early alert program from the development phase to the implementation phase 3. Student surveys to determine if the intervention increased/decreased their ability to continue successfully in their course(s).
* What is done poorly?
* Dedicated analyst to properly program, code, and manage the back end of the software.
* Marketing to students, staff, and faculty have been minimal.
* Training opportunities occur via email, in the early phases of the programs implementation, there was training opportunities at New Faculty Orientation and HR days.
* What should be avoided?
* Use of additional surveys each semester. Too many surveys in a semester minimizes the affect and reduced the amount of surveys completed by faculty.
* The cost associated with such software.
* Silos of the program. We found that not including the college as a whole in the decision of the software and the development of the Early Alert program did not create the level of buy-in that is necessary for a program such as this to be successful.
* What is the program doing that could be done more effectively/efficiently?
* Flag assignments for follow-up. Advisors follow-up and do not always have too much time to follow-up with flags that are assigned to them especially during peak times.
* Completion of surveys, by instructors, needs to increase to properly identify students in need. Report over the last two years show less than half of the surveys sent out were completed by faculty (See Chart 1).
* What is the program not doing that it should be doing?
* Increase awareness of Early Alert benefits to students, faculty, and staff could be a goal. This would mean additional training; How and when to use Early Alert (faculty),
* Use of features in the software such as Raise your hand, integration with Learning Management System, two-way communication with Banner, and text messaging (additional cost).
* List one thing that could be changed to help the program function more effectively.
* Advisor follow-up with student concerns could be assigned by cohort/major if advisors were assigned. We are moving to a pathways model that could serve as a better option when using early alert intervention.

Opportunities – These are aspects of the program that you want to expand upon in the future because they will help you reach your constituents more effectively. Generally, they occur because of a change in external or internal markets and situations (i.e. social, economic, and cultural trends) invite involvement by the program.

* Where are the good opportunities for the program?
* Collaboration with community organizations for student referral into mental health, homelessness, food insecurities, and substance abuse intervention.
* What are the applicable market trends/department trends the program is aware of
* Early alert programs work best when targeting specific student populations such as first-year students, GPA, and student athletes to name a few. CCC was unable to set parameters in these type of cohorts due to the limited resources.
* Identify any applicable trends the program will be utilizing moving forward.
* N/A

Threats – These are issues which in the future may thwart the progress or effectiveness of the program (i.e. a private school opening in Coconino County that delivers a similar service).

* What obstacles does the program face?
* N/A
* Are there required specifications for your program changing?
* N/A
* Is changing technology threatening the program?
* Starfish Early Alert continues to enhance their features to streamline the process but due to limited resources, the college has not been able to take advantage of such features.
* Are there financial issues?
* As a result of budgetary concerns, Starfish Early Alert will no longer be used at Coconino Community College.
* Are any of the weaknesses a serious threat to the program?
* N/A

# Recommendations and Future Directions

## 1 to 3 Year Recommendations (List recommendations in order of priority of completion.)

Provide the goal, objective, timeframe, responsible party(ies), and resources implications. Plans to help improve student success.

After four years of utilization, the college has decided to re-allocate resources allotted for Early Alert into areas that directly serve students. Funds were reallocated to help support the pathways project and the new advising model by using the cost of Starfish to create one additional advisor to the CCC advising department. The starting salary of an advisor at CCC is $38,397. Initiatives that are moving the college in the direction of degree pathways will support student-advisor relationship that includes degree milestones for students. This effort will include collaboration from various departments of the college including advising, registration, academics, and administration.

The college has a referral program, CARE (formerly REACH), where faculty and staff can refer a student that is experiencing difficulties in academics or in their personal lives. CARE has been a behavioral focus but the college will require a greater collaboration to create a more systematic program.

## Revision of Current Goals, if applicable

N/A

## Future Direction (5-year view)

Where will this program be in five years? What evolutions needs to occur for the program to continue to meets its purpose and objectives.

Starfish will not continue beyond the 18-19 fiscal year. Some things will need to be in place before the college can re-evaluate the use of a systematic early alert process that is not highly dependent on a tool, in order for this to occur the following items must be taken into consideration:

* Building a cross-functional team of faculty and Student Affairs to begin to build a culture of “See Something, Report Something.” By establishing this culture, when a tool is found, it will help build the culture.
* Further exploration of how to specifically embed early alert within the pathways project.
* Research the best times to contact faculty and students in regards to early alert. Some research shows that this contact and alert needs to happen as early as the first or second week of the semester.
* Explore and evaluate the capabilities of the tools we currently own as a college to determine if they can help facilitate the early alert process, such as Salesforce.
* The use of Canvas as a monitoring tool if faculty utilized the electronic gradebook and attendance features to identify struggling students and notify the students themselves.

Although the college is currently focusing on direct services to students, a new application, student/advisor case management, and degree pathways all of which may prove to be helpful in creating a new process for early alert.

Directly related services to students will include the implementation of degree pathways and a new advising model where students will have assigned advisors. These two initiatives will include student check-ins with their advisor and degree milestones such as educational planning, and two semester one-on-one advisor meetings.

Year one

* Research will be needed to identify faculty’s best options for early intervention on their students i.e. CARE, CANVAS, phone calls. Building a cross-functional team, such as the Retention Committee, would be necessary for this research. This research will help to build a culture of, “See something, say something”.

Year two

* Software research, creating a matrix to share with all stakeholders of the college.

Year three

* Identify best option including feedback from students, faculty, and staff.

Year four and five

* Create policies and procedures that will help sustain the program. Creating a marketing campaign will further increase the program awareness and name recognition.

**Appendix A: Advisor by major**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Major** | **Advisor** |
| AJS/Fire Science/Paramedic | Nichole Gregory |
| ASL | Mike Luna |
| Business (BUS, HRM) | Sonjia Jones |
| CIS | Derik Yellowhair |
| Construction | Derik Yellowhair |
| Environmental Studies | Mike Luna |
| Fine Arts (Colorado Plateau & Fine Arts) | Mike Luna |
| Health & Nursing | Martha James Johnson |
| Social Sciences (ANT, PSY, SOC) | Mitch Driebe |
| General Studies | All advisors |
| Undeclared | Brian Francis |

**Annual cost for Starfish Connect – Early Alert software**

The chart below is a user-friendly view of the information provided by IT.

Starfish

P2140245 – “Starfish Early Alert & Connect” – Amount paid: $46,700

P2150188 – “Starfish Early Alert & Connect” – Amount paid: $39,040

*Starfish was purchased by Hobsons in 2015*

Hobsons

P2160207 – “Starfish Professional Services (hourly remote)” – Amount paid: $1,440

P2160247 – “Starfish Early Alert & Connect” – Amount paid: $41,440

P2160249 – “Starfish Prospective Student Advising” – Amount paid: $2,880

P2170299 – “Starfish Early Alert & Connect” – Amount paid: $20,881.03

P2180128 – “Starfish Consulting Hours” – Amount paid: $2,000

P2180123 – “Starfish Early Alert & Connect” – Amount paid: $50,117.59

P2190063 – “Starfish Core & Project Consulting” – Amount paid: $52,330.35